Network Working Group
Request for Comments #238
NIC #7663
Category:
Updates: RFC #171, RFC #172

R. T. Braden
UCLA-CCN
September 29, 1971

7663

Rcvd 17Oct71

COMMENTS ON DTP AND FTP PROPOSALS

Data Transfer Protocol

1. In the Descriptor/Count mode, the Information Separators should have a transaction sequence number field. Otherwise, the receiver cannot be sure he received all transactions before the separation. This requires that there be two forms of information separators, one for Descriptor/Count mode, the other for the DLE mode.

2. The modes-available handshake should not be mandatory, as it makes no sense in the simplex case. The receiver doesn't care what modes the transmitter might use; he only cares what mode is used, which he discovers when the first data or control transaction arrives. Even in the duplex case, it is not clear what use the receiver should make of the modes-available information from the transmitter.

File Transfer Protocol

1. The protocol allows an end-of-file to be indicated by closing the connection. This is the same mistake which we made in an early version of NETRJS. Closing the connection without a File Separator transaction should only be used to indicate an error, i.e., to abort the transmission; it should never be used to indicate normal completion of file transfer. The reason is obvious: there is no way for the receiver to tell whether CLS indicates normal completion or an abnormal condition in the other host (e.g. the file transfer program died).

2. There should be two forms of the store request, one which fails if a file of the same name already exists, and one which replaces an existing file of the same name (as now).

3. A service center host may be expected to require username and password transactions before any others are accepted.

4. There are no error transactions defined for lost data or lost synch. It is assumed there are handled at the DTP level?

5. All of the defined error codes should be allowed (and encouraged) to have explanatory text following them.

RTB:gjm